

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

The perceived transformation and transactional leadership styles among Tambon health promoting hospitals directors related to job satisfaction in Nakhonratchasima province, Thailand

Waranyou Satayavongtip,¹ Aroonsri Mongkolchati,² and Supattra Srivanichakorn,³

¹ M.P.H.M., ASEAN Institute for Health Development, Mahidol University, Thailand

² Ph.D., ASEAN Institute for Health Development, Mahidol University, Thailand

³ MD. M.P.H. (Health Development), Department of Disease Control, Ministry of Public Health, Thailand

Corresponding author: Aroonsri Mongkolchati Email: aroonsri.mon@mahidol.ac.th

Received: 30 May 2016 Revised: 8 June 2016 Accepted: 10 June 2016

Available online: June 2016

Abstract

Satayavongtip W, Mongkolchati A. and Srivanichakorn S.

The perceived transformation and transactional leadership styles among Tambon health promoting hospitals directors related to job satisfaction in Nakhonratchasima province, Thailand

J Pub. Health Dev. 2016; 14(1):37-52

Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) are the first level of public health service system. Before the health service system reform, the THPHs confronted with inefficient management. Leadership and job satisfaction in THPHs have been developed and expanded responsibilities to conform health system reformation in Thailand. This research aimed to identify the perceived transformation and transactional leadership behaviors among THPHs directors associated with their jobs satisfaction.

A cross-sectional survey was conducted in 32 district health offices which consisted 349 directors of sub-districts health offices. The sample of 267 directors was randomly selected from Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals of Nakhonratchasima province, Thailand. The self-administered questionnaires were used to collect data by the mail survey which enclosed self-addressed stamped envelopes. The response rate was 100%. The survey period was limited in 30 days during April to May in 2013. The questionnaires composed of 3 parts: socio-economic factors, district public health officer leadership behaviors and job satisfaction which obtained reliability of 0.989 and 0.975. Descriptive statistics, Chi-square test and multiple logistic regression were used to analyze the data.

This study found that overall satisfaction of directors in Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals were moderate level. They were proud of their work and found that their work were challenging (mean score of motivating factor=2.38), although their working conditions were not fully supporting them (mean score of hygiene factor = 2.13). After adjusting for confounding factors, this study found that the strongest factors were monthly salary factor (Adj. OR=2.379, 95% CI=1.169-3.850) and the perceived overall leadership style of transformation and transactional leadership within the high level (Adj. OR=70.801, 95% CI=8.691-576.804) significantly associated to job satisfaction among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals directors (p-value<0.05).

The management for training directors in Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals or in district healthcare centers should be focused mainly on job satisfaction. This has to be provided to meet their sufficient salary and overtime payments, sufficient personnel, and modern and standard instruments. To develop human capital of district health promoting hospital administrators, the directors of THPHS should emphasize on leadership development especially in promoting inspiration and conditional rewards.

Keywords: transformation and transactional leadership style, job satisfaction, Tambon Health promoting hospitals

การศึกษาความสัมพันธ์ระหว่างการรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำแบบเปลี่ยนสภาพภาวะผู้นำแบบแลกเปลี่ยนและความพึงพอใจในการทำงานของผู้อำนวยการโรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล จังหวัดนราธิวาส ประเทศไทย

วรัญญา สัตยวงศ์พิพิธ¹ อรุณศรี มงคลชาติ² สุพัตรา ศรีวิษชากร³

¹ M.P.H.M. สถาบันพัฒนาสุขภาพอาเซียน มหาวิทยาลัยมหิดล ประเทศไทย

² Ph.D., สถาบันพัฒนาสุขภาพอาเซียน มหาวิทยาลัยมหิดล ประเทศไทย

³ MD. M.P.H. (Health Development), กรมควบคุมโรคติดต่อ กระทรวงสาธารณสุข ประเทศไทย

บทคัดย่อ

วรัญญา สัตยวงศ์พิพิธ อรุณศรี มงคลชาติ และ สุพัตรา ศรีวิษชากร

การศึกษาความสัมพันธ์ระหว่างการรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำแบบเปลี่ยนสภาพภาวะผู้นำแบบแลกเปลี่ยนและความพึงพอใจในการทำงานของผู้อำนวยการโรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล จังหวัดนราธิวาส ประเทศไทย

ว.สาธารณสุขและการพัฒนา. 2559;14(1):37-52

โรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล (รพสต.) เป็นหน่วยงานด้านแรกของการบริการสาธารณสุข ก่อนการปฏิรูประบบสุขภาพพบว่าโรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล ได้เพิ่งรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำแบบเปลี่ยนสภาพภาวะผู้นำและความพึงพอใจในการปฏิบัติงานในรพสต. ได้มีการพัฒนาและมีการขยายตัวอย่างต่อเนื่องเพื่อให้มีการสอดรับกับการพัฒนาระบบบริการสุขภาพและการดำเนินการปฏิรูประบบสุขภาพของประเทศไทยการศึกษาครั้งนี้มีวัตถุประสงค์เพื่อศึกษาความสัมพันธ์ระหว่างการรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำแบบเปลี่ยนสภาพภาวะผู้นำแบบแลกเปลี่ยนและความพึงพอใจในการทำงานของผู้อำนวยการโรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล จังหวัดนราธิวาส ประเทศไทย

การศึกษาครั้งนี้เป็นแบบภาพตัดขวาง โดยทำการศึกษาในประชากรกลุ่มผู้อำนวยการโรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล (รพสต.) จำนวน 32 ตำบล ของจังหวัดนราธิวาส ประเทศไทยผู้อำนวยการ รพสต. จำนวน 349 คนได้ถูกคัดเลือกเพื่อเป็นกลุ่มตัวอย่างแบบสุ่ม อย่างง่าย ได้ตัวอย่างมาทั้งสิ้น จำนวน 267 คนการเก็บข้อมูลดำเนินการระหว่างเดือนเมษายน ถึงเดือนพฤษภาคม 2556 กลุ่มตัวอย่างตอบแบบสอบถามด้วยตนเอง และได้ส่งกลับมาทางไปรษณีย์ ซึ่งได้รับการตอบรับมา ร้อยละ 100 แบบสอบถามที่ได้ใช้ในการศึกษาแบ่งออกเป็น 3 ส่วนได้แก่ ส่วนที่ 1 คือปัจจัยทางด้านเศรษฐกิจสังคมของผู้ตอบแบบสอบถาม ส่วนที่ 2 คือพฤติกรรมด้านความพึงพอใจในการทำงานของกลุ่มตัวอย่าง และส่วนสุดท้าย คือการรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำของกลุ่มตัวอย่าง การทดสอบความเชื่อมั่นอยู่ที่ระดับ 0.989 และ 0.975 ตามลำดับ

การศึกษาครั้งนี้พบว่า ผู้อำนวยการ รพสต. ที่เป็นกลุ่มเป้าหมายมีความพึงพอใจในการทำงานระดับปานกลาง มีความภาคภูมิใจและเห็นว่างานมีความท้าทาย (ค่าเฉลี่ยระดับ=2.38) และเห็นว่างานที่ทำงานไม่ได้รับการสนับสนุนด้านวัสดุอุปกรณ์มากนัก (ค่าเฉลี่ย=2.13) หลังจากการวิเคราะห์การทดสอบอัจฉริภาพทุก群 โดยได้มีการปรับด้วยปัจจัยที่เป็นปัจจัยงานต่างๆ แล้วพบว่า ตัวแปรที่มีค่าความสัมพันธ์สูงที่สุด ได้แก่ กลุ่มผู้อำนวยการรพสต. ที่มีระดับเงินเดือนต่ำกว่าค่าเฉลี่ย (29,610 บาท) มีความเสี่ยงสูงในการไม่มีความพึงพอใจในการทำงาน (Adj. OR=2.379, 95% CI=1.169-3.850) เมื่อเทียบกับกลุ่มที่มีรายได้สูงกว่าค่าเฉลี่ย (29,610 บาท) และพบว่า ในกลุ่มผู้อำนวยการ รพสต. ที่มีการรับรู้ภาวะผู้นำแบบเปลี่ยนสภาพและภาวะผู้นำแบบแลกเปลี่ยนในระดับสูงมีความสัมพันธ์กับความพึงพอใจในการทำงานเมื่อเทียบกับกลุ่มที่มีการรับรู้ต่ำ(Adj. OR=70.801, 95% CI=8.691-576.804) อย่างมีนัยสำคัญทางสถิติ (p -value<0.05)

การศึกษาครั้งนี้บ่งชี้ว่า การอบรมหลักสูตรผู้บริหาร ในกลุ่มผู้อำนวยการ รพสต. มีความจำเป็นและความมุ่งประเด็นการเพิ่มความพึงพอใจในการทำงาน โดยควรได้รับการสนับสนุนส่งเสริมค่าตอบแทนการทำงาน จำนวนพนักงาน เครื่องมือที่ทันสมัย และเห็นควรส่งเสริมให้เกิดการธรรงค์การอบรมหรือส่งเสริมความรู้โดยเฉพาะกลุ่มผู้อำนวยการ โรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบลในเรื่องภาวะผู้นำ การสร้างแรงจูงใจในการทำงาน ตลอดจนการให้รางวัล เพื่อสร้างขวัญกำลังใจให้เกิดการพัฒนามากยิ่งขึ้น อีกทั้งควรได้ทำการศึกษาลึกลับตุ้นตานี้ในโอกาสต่อไป

Keywords: ผู้นำการเปลี่ยนแปลงและผู้นำแบบแลกเปลี่ยนความพึงพอใจในการทำงาน โรงพยาบาลส่งเสริมสุขภาพระดับตำบล

Introduction

Transactional leadership initiated by Bernard and Bass^{1,2}. The transactional leadership principle is that the leaders should evaluate subordinates needs in order to motivate them to do what the leaders want by providing rewards, work positions and other things that their subordinates want. Bass^{1,2} defined that transactional leadership theory means that it is the way that the leaders explain to their staffs in order to make them understand their roles and what they need to be done is needed to be achieve by explaining what incentives they will get to motivate them to achieve in their work which consists two elements. Burn^{1,2,3} found that transnational leadership is the process that where leaders and officers have only one goal. Transformational leadership fosters people who believe and tie in visions and empower officers by their visions. Titchy and Devanna⁴ have studied transactional leadership and concluded that the transactional leadership traits are the leaders who include those who lead carry their responsible organizations towards better and shared goals, openness, being able to face the truth and believe in each other's being life-long learners, be able to face the complex and unclear situations, and have vision.

In regarding to leadership, there are many academics who have given these ideas and concepts⁵. This is because effective leadership is important to the success of an organizations. Leadership is the focal point of the research and the building of theory continuously in order to improve and expand leadership traits, behaviors and situational theory. In addition to this, a researcher also have considered closely about the roles of managerial leadership under the complex environment and exchange. For this reason, new

leadership theories are emerged continuously. Interesting research methodology nowadays is includes the transformational leadership: leadership through vision and charisma and also is called by many names such as inspirational leadership, symbolic leadership etc. Boonyanurak⁶ said that transformational leadership must be the persons who have skills in interrelationship and personal relationship, flexible, self-confident, wide visions, have skills in providing knowledge, motivate and promote followers. Bernard Bass^{1,2} adapted transformational and transactional leadership theory from Bass and Burns^{1,2} to be the research concepts in order to study the managerial performance activities by transformational and transactional leaders. The research finds that leaders who can lead the work to achieve the goal effectively, mostly, are the leaders who have transformational leadership rather than transactional leadership, which is in accordance with Stordeur et.al.'s study^{1,2}. They found that the work quality in the units that are supervised by hospital managers who have better transformational leadership is better than those in the unit with the hospital managers who have transactional leadership.

There are many previous studies^{4,7,8} on transformation and transactional leadership reported explained that transformational leadership traits are being transformational leaders by transforming organizations towards the better goals, direct the subordinates to BE aware of the values of the goals, work to be successful, life-long learners and visionaries. Kuhnert and Lewis⁷ also found that transformational leaders will sacrifice their own interests to catch the followers' minds and motivate followers to see the values of ideal work or dignity to work not only for salary or just day to day work. In addition, Bauman⁸ pointed

that transformation leader's gave power to individuals in organizations by developing collective leadership between individuals and also positioning themselves as transformational leadership. McDaniel and Wolf⁹ studied the transformation leadership of the chief's nurse, found that it has positive relationships with nursing staff's satisfaction and retention rate. Felton¹⁰ studied the relationship of the transformational and transactional leadership of directors in primary and secondary schools and found that it relates to teacher work satisfaction, significantly.

In Thailand, it has been announced the key issue on increasing human resources capacity building in the 9th socio-economic development plan (A.D.2002-2006), and indicated that paradigm of integrated national development must base on "Human center". That means human capital is the most important asset to be developed¹¹. To be one of the ASEAN community, Thailand have highly potential in health services capacity which means not only 67 million Thai citizens but also the people that need this services as well. The impacts on the form of workload burden and public health problems aspects will be main non-avoidable issue in the near future¹².

Basically, Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) are the first contact of health services in Thailand health systems unit, it has been adopted the concept by WHO, the responsibility for health promotion in health services unit which provided health professionals, health service institutions from the governments for people as individuals and community level. They must work together towards a health care system which contributes to the pursuit of health. Not only its responsibility for providing clinical and curative services but also the unit must

take the role of the health sector and must move forward to increase and promote in health promotion among the people both individuals and communities for a healthier life¹³.

For their quality development program that needed to improve scarce of resources such as medical equipment, financial as well as personnel, to cover the expectations and health problem among the setting population¹³. That makes these personnel facing with so many consequent effects, coming from their deficiency. Chanmaneerat, et al¹⁵ found that the main problems of THPHS are the combination of personnel shortage, low morale but high workload, low salary, and poor budget associated with job performance. Kaewcharus^{16,17} also found that the priority issues of THPHS needed urgent correction are personnel morale and stressfulness from lacking of career progression and low salary because its effect directly on jobs satisfaction.

In the dynamic and rapid growth changing the world the administrator as an organization leader must be introduced the characteristics of transformation and transactional leadership¹.

Jobs satisfaction is considered as the key role of organization success¹⁷. The main factor that brings to staff satisfaction is the leader of their own, because of highly effective leaders will have very potential influence to everyone performance¹⁹. According to a study of satisfaction by Herzberg's theory¹⁹, it was mentioned that when personnel have enough jobs satisfaction they will perform in high efficiency output. This satisfaction has two categories namely the motivation factor and the hygiene factor. The motivation factor is comprised of its own job characters, such as happiness from progression or job achievement.

The hygiene factors a kind of anxious reduction or prevention from dis-satisfaction, such as jobs policy, low incentive, inadequate training and these issues might lead to the jobs failure at the end. Another one study performed of transformation and transactional leadership found that both these two types of leaderships could have been reached an achievement on the job efficiently²¹.

In Thailand, the provincial health office units have implemented many projects on capacity building among the district health officers, particularly on the development of leadership in various aspects, several studies^{9,10,19,21} reported the positive relationship between leadership and job satisfaction among nurse and other health care provider but little is known about the information related to transformation and transactional leadership which link to job satisfaction particularly among THPHs directors. Therefore, this research aimed to identify the perceived of transformation and transactional leadership behaviors among THPHs directors associated with their jobs satisfaction in Nakhonratchasima province. The findings will be benefit for human resources development particularly among THPHs directors in the sub-district level of Thailand.

Methods

Study site

A cross sectional survey was conducted among 267 Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors which THPHS locates in urban and rural area in Nakhonratchasima province, Thailand. There are 32 districts health offices including 349 directors of sub districts health office were included in this study. THPHS has continually improved alternative

strategies to increase the capacity building among the directors. Self-administered questionnaires were used, data collection was done by mail surveys that include self-address stamped envelopes to be easily returned back to researchers. The mail survey period was limited in 30 days during April to May in 2013.

Sample

Research samples were 349 Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) Directors who worked under Nakhon Ratchasima Provincial Health Office in 32 districts. The target population for the study was THPHS directors who were assigned as Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors 32 district, NakhonRatchasima Province. The sampling technique was stratified sampling with proportional to size from information system of primary health care units. The total number of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors was 349 persons. The population were all randomly selected and a random sampling selected was used to include the sample of each THPHS from 32 district. An additional 5% was added to the sample because of self-administration mail survey, thus the required sample size was rounded up to 267. However a total of 267 self-administered questionnaires were 100% completely returned to this study.

Instrument

The structured questionnaire was conducted and it was divided into three parts;

Part 1 was socio-economic factors which included gender, age, education level, profession career path, salary, experiences, training experiences, workloads, family income and homeland.

Part 2 was district public health officers' leadership behaviors, charismatic building (5 ques-

tions), individual identity realized (5 questions), intelligence motivated (5 questions), inspiration promoted (5 questions), conditional rewards given and management by exemption (5 questions). The questionnaire had 5 scale measures to evaluate in 5 dimensions.

Transformational leadership according to Bernard and Bass², have analyzed the categories of transformational leaders into five categories.

Charismatic building means the leaders who have inner power to influence on their officers. The people who have charisma has the characters as follows; 1. Provide better future imaginary than present and officers accepts that imaginary 2. Be brave to take risks on their working positions or money for subordinates' interests rather than their own interests 3. Use new methods to achieve the common imagination 4. Be able to evaluate the situation accurately, timely, and appropriately to the need and values of officers in order to build the imaginations which are in common, appropriate and impressive 5. Make their officers unsatisfied with the current situation

Individual's identity realized, means that the leaders can response to officers' needs according to the different job responsibilities, providing participatory services, giving advices and supports, supporting and promoting officers to develop themselves, which can be concluded into three types; Development-oriented. Evaluate the present and future position to be the blueprint for subordinates to copy. Individual-oriented, have interactions with subordinates individually and be friendlier than using memorandum. Mentoring, provide assistance and advice for new executives.

Intelligence motivated, means that the leaders stimulate followers to change in realizing threats

that the organizations are facing and compare the received interests and how to solve the problems with consideration before translating into practice.

Inspiration promoted, means stimulating or creating the officers to work and recognize needs, values and aims of the organizations with enthusiasm, and provide all efforts in work for the groups' success.

Conditional rewards given and management by exemption means the contingent reward is the positive support. It is the agreement between leaders and officers about what they will get as incentives if the works are done successfully. And, management by exception means that the leaders use the appropriate negative support when officers have not done their work successfully or have done their work below standards

Part 3 was job satisfaction using (30 questions with 3 rating scales). which are based on Herzberg's Theory¹¹, which consists of two main factors; motivational factors composed of five working elements, which are; *success*; means to be proud of current works which customers feel satisfied with given services and staffs are able to solve their work problems, *advancement*; means to have opportunities in further training to enhance knowledge and skills, *acceptance*; means to be accepted from people and any their suggestions are always accepted by executives and colleagues, *responsibility*; means to be proud of current works, and be able to finish within the deadline. *Work itself* means they can use their own knowledge and experience in developing their jobs, and have freedom in decision making. Hygiene factors are also composed of five working elements, which are; *management and administration*, means to understand THE organization's policy, their boss come

in to response managing staff respond to problems and helping in improve works. *Consultation*; means district public health officers provide opportunities to consult freely, prioritize comments and recommendations, and help everyone equally. Salary promotion; means, salary pay are promoted appropriate with performance, having enough salary and over-time wage, and being satisfied with the current welfare. *Working condition* means the numbers of staffs are appropriate with workloads. Workloads are appropriate with working time. *Interpersonal* relations means to be able to communicate with colleagues.

Content validity of all questions was tested by 3 experts and reliability was level equal 0.989. There were 100 % of 267 successful questionnaires returned to the researchers.

Data analysis

The statistics used for data analysis were SPSS for windows. Frequency, percentage, mean, and standard deviation (S.D.) were used for descriptive statistics. Chi-square test, Pearson's product moment Correlation Coefficients analysis and Multiple Logistic Regression with statistically significant at the 0.05 level were used for inference statistics to identify the relationship between the factors and the outcome.

Results

This study found that the gender of the Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals directors are nearly equally male and female (50.2% and 49.80%). Mean age of the respondents was 44.87 years old (Min = 24.00, Max = 60.00). All of them graduated with bachelor's degrees. Of 22.10 % continue their study career to receive Master degree and of 81.30% of them started their career path as academic higher position in public health officers. Only 18.70% of them changed their career from public health to be professional nurses. Their mean salary was 29,610.00 baht (Min = 9,810, Max = 45,522.00). Their mean years of experiences were 23 years. Most of them (70%) were trained as the public health administration course. One-third (30.0%) of them never been trained as management training course. Regarding to the workloads, it was found that many of them (60.30%) found that their workloads were moderate. Only 8.60% found that their responsibilities were low. For family and socio-demography, it was found that almost third-fourth of them (73.8%) had enough money for household expenditure. For homeland, of 62.5 % were working for their hometown.

This study showed that of overall jobs satisfactions of among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors had moderate score for jobs satisfaction (mean= 2.26, S.D.=0.69) as shown in table 1. The total score was taken part mainly from motivation factors rather than from hygiene factors (2.38 and 2.13).

Table 1 Score of Jobs satisfaction among Health Promoting Tumbol Hospitals (THPHs) directors

Jobs satisfaction	Mean	S.D.	max	min
Overall Jobs satisfaction	2.26	0.69	3	1
<i>Motivation Factor</i>	2.38	0.72	3	1
Success	2.51	0.57	3	1
Advancement	2.38	0.57	3	1
Acceptance	2.49	0.58	3	1
Job responsibilities	2.47	0.57	3	1
Workloads	2.37	0.55	3	1
<i>Hygiene Factor</i>	2.13	0.70	3	1
Policy and management	2.46	0.59	3	1
Consultation	2.37	0.62	3	1
Salary promotion	2.10	0.67	3	1
Working conditions	1.90	0.63	3	1
Interpersonal relationship	2.37	0.61	3	1

According to scores of the perceived behaviors transformational and transactional leadership of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors, this study indicated that perceive of transformation

and transactional leadership overall scores was 4.01, which was accounted for 73.8% as shown in table 2 and table 3.

Table 2 Score of Transformation leader and transactional leadership among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors

Transformation leader and Transactional leadership	Mean	S.D.	max	min
Overall	4.01	0.71	5.00	1.00
Charismatic building	4.09	0.74	5.00	1.60
Individual's identity realized	3.98	0.68	5.00	1.60
Intelligence motivated	4.01	0.66	5.00	2.00
Inspiration promoted	3.98	0.73	5.00	1.60
Conditional rewards given and management by exemption	3.97	0.73	5.00	1.60

Table 3 Percentage of level of transformation leader and transactional leadership among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors

Factors (N=267)	High		Moderate		Low	
	n	%	n	%	n	%
Overall leadership	197	73.8	48	18.0	22	8.2
Charismatic building	206	72.2	44	16.5	17	6.4
Individual's identity realized	203	76.0	48	18.0	16	6.0
Intelligence motivated	206	77.2	42	15.7	19	7.1
Inspiration promoted	196	73.4	50	18.7	21	7.9
Conditional rewards given and management by exemption	193	72.3	55	20.6	19	7.1

Regarding to association between socio-demographic factors, transformation, transactional leadership and jobs satisfaction, this study revealed that the socio-demographic factors, salary, training experiences, transformation and transactional leadership behaviors among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors associated with the level of jobs satisfaction significantly ($p<.05$) as shown in table 4.

Using multiple logistic regression which the confounding factors were controlled, for the predictors and the job satisfaction among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors, it was

found that respondents who had salary less than mean (29,610 bath) have lower job satisfaction than those who have more than mean score for 2 time higher (Adj. OR=2.379, 95% CI, 1.169 - 3.850). the perceived of overall leadership (transformation and transactional leadership) in high and moderate level related to job satisfaction 17 times and 70 times higher (Adj. OR=17.54, 95% CI=2.049–150.218), (Adj. OR=70.801, 95% CI=8.691–576.804) than those who have low perceived on overall leadership respectively as shown in table5.

Table 4 Associations between Socio-demographic factors and Jobs satisfaction (n= 267) among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors

Variables	Job satisfaction		Crude OR (95% CI)	p-value
	High (%)	Low (%)		
Sex				
Male	77(57.5)	57(42.5)	1	0.342
Female	84(63.2)	49(36.8)	1.26(0.776-2.074)	
Age				
≤ 45 years	75(55.6)	60(44.4)	1	0.109
> 45 years	86(65.2)	46(34.8)	1.49(0.913-2.459)	
Education				
Bachelor	121(58.2)	87(41.8)	1	0.182
Master	40(67.8)	19(32.2)	1.51(0.821-2.790)	
Type of professions				
Public health	128(59.0)	89(41.0)	1	0.361
Nurse	33(66.0)	17(34.0)	1.35(0.708-2.572)	
Monthly Salary				
< 29,610 Baht	63(50.8)	61(49.2)	1	0.003*
≥ 29,610 Baht	98(68.5)	45(31.5)	2.68(1.281-3.471)	
Working Experience				
<23 years	67(54.9)	55(45.1)	1	0.099
≥ 23 years	94(64.8)	51(35.2)	1.51(0.924-2.478)	
Training experience				
Yes	121(64.7)	66(35.3)	1	0.024*
No	40(50.0)	40(50.0)	0.54(0.321-0.928)	
Workloads				
High	48(57.8)	35(42.2)	1	
Moderate	97(60.2)	64(39.8)	1.66(0.620 – 4.482)	0.588
Low	16(69.6)	7(30.4)	1.10(0.645 – 1.893)	0.203
Total family income				
Enough	124(62.9)	73(37.1)	1	
Not enough	37(52.9)	33(47.1)	0.66(0.380-1.145)	0.138
Homeland				
Yes	101(60.5)	66(39.5)	1	
No	60(60.0)	40(40.0)	0.98(0.591-1.626)	0.938
Overall Leadership				
Low	1(4.5)	21(95.5)	1	
Moderate	21(43.8)	27(56.2)	16.33(2.029 – 131.469)	0.001*
High	139(70.6)	58(29.4)	50.32(6.614 – 382.949)	0.001

*p-value <0.05

Table 5 Multiple Logistic Regression Analysis for Prediction of Job Satisfaction

Variables	Adjusted OR (95%CI)	p-value
Sex		
Female	1	
Male	0.605 (0.332 - 1.101)	0.100
Age		
≥ 45 years	1	
<45 years	1.667 (0.743 - 3.741)	0.215
Monthly Salary		
< 29,610 Baht	1	
≥ 29,610 Baht	2.379 (1.169 - 3.850)	0.019*
Training experience		
Yes	1	
No	1.758 (0.935 -3.307)	0.080
Workload		
High	1	
Moderate	1.056 (0.563 - 1.981)	0.864
Low	2.866 (0.810 - 10.140)	0.103
Overall leadership		
Low	1	
Moderate	17.544 (2.049 -150.218)	0.009*
High	70.801 (8.691- 576.804)	0.000*

* p<.05

Discussion

This study found that among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors, they have A moderate overall jobs satisfaction score (mean=2.26, S.D.=0.69). This result supported the previous studies in Thailand^{22,23} which studied among the district health officers and found that 78% of district health officers are moderately satisfied with their jobs. This result showed similarly result to the previous study²⁴ was done in Japan which investigate job satisfaction among 410 Japanese nurses, most of the nurses felt strongly dissatisfied with their working condition. It may be possible that working as nurse may create higher stress

condition than those who working as Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors. This result might be explained from the previous study²⁵, that working in district health officers were the lacking of medical supplies or limited resources which can lead to poor working professional conditions, hence they may not satisfy on their job.

The overall results of the perceived transformation and transactional leadership among the Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors were high level (mean=4.01). This result indicated similarly finding to one study^{26,27} which founded that overall transformation and transactional leadership of the

school administrators were high level. Another similarly study also found that job satisfaction among sub district Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors at Ubonratchathanee province, Thailand was moderate level^{28, 29}. This may be possible that the working as nurse may create the feeling as same as working condition of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors.

For this study, it is indicated that the factor of transformation and transactional leadership related to job satisfaction, this result showed same direction with Anant Chaikulwatana, et al²⁷ that transformation and transactional leadership among district health officers correlated with job satisfaction. Another study also found the similarly result that leadership style among nurse in Malaysia related with jobs satisfaction score²⁸ (p-value <0.001).

By using multiple logistic regression to determine the predictors and job satisfaction among Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors and this study revealed that monthly salary and transformation and transactional leadership related to job satisfaction significantly (p-value< 0.05). The previous studies done by Fernandes, C, et al²⁹ and Sultana A., et al.³⁰, also found that Hygiene factor on salary and benefit are the two most sending effect on satisfaction . This could be explained that no matter how heavy or light the workload, the working values and it's environment had nothing to do to encourage or discourage work success. This research found that the main key factors which related to work towards organization goals was salary and compensation. Although it did not relate to hygiene factor, it was much related to motivation factor to work toward goals, which means, when we want to obtain more goals from sub-district

health promoting hospital, we need to consider more on compensation, which should be associated with desired workloads and indicators. All leaders should prioritize this issue and may use this topic to drive other important public health problems.

In addition, the study were done by Mc Daniel and Wolf³¹ and Felton³² also found similarly direction that transformation and transactional leadership have correlation with job satisfaction. One study done by Mahmood Ghorbani, et al³² also found that perceived transformation leadership TO have positive correlation with effectiveness of personnel creativity as same as a study done by Nopparat Morsup³⁴, revealed that transformation leadership of directors of sub-district health promotion hospitals have strongly effect to organization climate that lead to achievement of team in Thailand. In addition, a study done by Morrison et al³⁵ reported that the relation between leadership style and empowerment on job satisfaction among nurses in Iran, transformation and transactional leadership have positive relation with job satisfaction and helping increase their values on jobs commitment, competency development and take ?better services. This could be interpreted that leadership development can be promote their staff satisfaction as well as encouraging the quality of services. The main key issue to be answered in the research question was the relationship between transformation and transactional leadership of district public health officers and job satisfaction of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors. It was found that the perceived transformation and transactional leadership of district health officers were related to the job satisfactions of their sub-ordinates for 70 times and 17 times for those who were in high and moderate, compare with

the low level. One study indicated that leadership is important to determine happiness in the office and work success of subordinates³⁶. The extreme ratio level of this relationship suggested that the engagement would be higher when the perceived leadership was high. For this reason, these leadership style performances should be encouraged continuously in district health personal officer level.

Conclusion and recommendations

In conclusion, every public health administration sections needs leaders who have efficient transformation and transactional leadership in order to have job satisfaction of all subordinates, which would resulted in organization loyalty and public health job creativity.

The research revealed that working in Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors have low hygiene but high motivation characteristics (job satisfaction). The public health officers were proud of their works and found that their works are challenging (motivation factor = 2.38), even though their working conditions were not fully support (hygiene factor mean = 2.13). For this reason, the management for developing district healthcare should be focused mainly on hygiene factors, which are sufficient salary and overtime payment (score=1.99), sufficient officers (score=1.87), modern, standard and quality instruments (score=1.88), hence as the directors or hospital administrators have to concern about their staff's workload, work condition as well as salary promotion. In addition, the district managers with leadership behaviors who were selected and developed by transformation and transactional leadership criterion should be more concern.

The chief of the public health care unit who has a high job satisfaction level would lead to the organization's work quality. Developing district public health officers' capacity would lead to stronger leadership. As we want to increase leadership potential. Practically, we should focus on the weakness of leadership aspect. In this study, we found two main keys issues that needed development were, firstly, it was inspiration promoted, for building creative working atmosphere, to energize team member ready for works (score=3.87). Secondly, the conditional, inspiration promoted, and rewards given and management by exemption, that provide confidence for Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (THPHs) directors, which would have enhanced them more fully devoted themselves to their works (score= 3.92).

Competing interests

The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest related to the authorship and/or publication of this article.

Acknowledgments

WS conceived the project, designed the study and collected and analyzed the data. AM were involved in revising manuscript, advising the study, interpreting the data, and drafting of the manuscript for important content. SS revised the manuscript as suggested by the reviewers. All authors have read the manuscript draft and approved the final copy. The researcher would like to thank Nakhonratchasima Provincial Health office, District Health Office and every District Health Officers who greatly facilitated the research. This research was funded by National Health Security

Office (NHSO) and NakhonRatchasima Provincial Health Office.

References

1. Srisatitnarakul B., Leadership and strategy on nursing management in 21th century. Bangkok: Printing Mill of Chulalongkorn University, 2007: 287-288.
2. Bernard M. Bass, Stogdill's handbook of leadership: A survey of theory and research. Revised and expanded edition. New York: The Free Press, 1981.
3. Nuntsupawat R., Nursing Leadership in Organization, Chiangmai: Nobburee Printing, 1999.
4. Tichy N.M., Devanna M.A., The Transformational leader. New York; John Wiley & Sons, 1986.
5. Naveekarn S., Administration and Organization Behavior. Bangkok: Manager, 1997.
6. Taweerut P., Research Methodology in Behavior science and Social science. Bangkok: Finger Print and Media, 1997.
7. Kuhnert K.W., Lewis P. Transformational and Transactional Leadership: A constructive development analysis of Management Review. 12(7), 1987: 648-657.
8. Bauman, D.J. Characteristics and operational styles of Transformational leaders. Dissertation Abstracts International – A, 49/12, 1989: p 3559.
9. McDaniel, C. and Wolf, G.A. Transformational Leadership in Nursing Science: a test of Theory. Journal of Nursing Administration. 22(1), 1992: 60-65.
10. Felton, S.L. Transactional and Transformational Leadership and Teacher Job Satisfaction. Dissertation Abstracts International. 67(7), 1995.
11. Office of the National Economics and Social Development Board. Document paper, Guideline for new public management strategic plan seminar. Bangkok: 2003. Page 4.
12. Sivarapornsaku T. Effect of Thai health services system from migration labors after ASEAN community involve men: A study at the Public Health Bureau area 4th. Document paper for seminar in the 5th Foreign affairs executive program, Devawongse Varopakarn Institute of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013, page 32.
13. Groene O, Alonso J, Klazinga N. Development and validation of the WHO self-assessment tool for health promotion in hospitals: results of a study in 38 hospitals in eight countries. Health Promotion International, 25 (2), 2010: 221-229
14. Peachpansri S., Viripirogomgool S., Thongcharoen V., Ronnarithivichai C. and Jamkrajang T. The development of community care model of sub-district health promoting hospitals for older persons. Journal of Public Health and Development Vol. 12 No. 3 September–December, 2014
15. Chanmaneerat S., Wiwatpongpun K., Praditbatuka S. The Assessment on Knowledge, Opinion and Outcome of Health Promoting Tumbol Hospitals policy among their own directors in the Public Health Bureau area 5th presentation paper in the 2nd post-graduate meeting. Sukhothaithummathirat University, 2012.
16. Kaewcharus B. Happiness at workplace among personnel in Tambol health promoting hospitals. Journal of Medical and Public Health Region 4, Vol.5 No.1 January-April 2015.

17. Payormyaem S. Industrial Psychology. 2nd Edition, Bangkok hula Book Center, 2002: 49.
18. Vitaya-udom V. Organization Behaviors. 4th Edition. Bangkok Thanatat Printing Co.Ltd, 2008: 419-421.
19. Stogdill, R.M. Leadership, Membership and organization. Psychological Bulletin, January; 1950: p4.
20. Herzberg. F., Mausner B. and Snyderman B., The Motivation to Work. New Brunswick: Transaction, Text Book, 1993.
21. Hater, John J.; Bass, Bernard M. Superiors' evaluations and subordinates' perceptions of transformational and transactional leadership. Journal of Applied Psychology, Vol 73(4), Nov 1988, 695-702.
22. Paisalnun K., Job Satisfaction of Health Center Personnel in Ratchaburi province. Bangkok: Master Science (Health Administration). Mahidol University, 2542.
23. Miyata H.. Job Satisfaction among Thai Traditional Masseurs in Bangkok, Thailand. Bangkok: Master of Primary Health Care Management. Mahidol University, 2011.
24. Wongwetwinit P. Health Center Chiefs' Satisfaction with and Work Motivation towards Implementation Outcomes of the Contracting Unit of Primary Care Board, Nakorn Ratchasima Provincial Health Office. The Journal of Boromarajonani College of Nursing, Nakhon Ratchasima. 17.2 (2013): 5-14.
25. Intaraprasong B., Potjanasitt S., Pattaraarchachai J, Meennuch. C., Situational Leadership Styles, Staff Nurse Job Characteristics Related to Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment of Head Nurses Working in Hospitals under the Jurisdiction of The Royal Thai Army. J Med Assoc Thai Vol. 95 Suppl. 6 2012.
26. Jailak K. Fitzgerald, Chaisongkram P. and Wongsan W. Leadership of the School Administrators Perceived by Teachers in Schools under the Office of Phang-nga Educational Service Area. RajabhatMahaSarakham University Journal; RMU.J. 2(1): January - April 2008
27. Chaikulwatana A., Thanavirun J. and Aramvirot M., Assessment of leadership among district public health officers and jobs satisfaction of sub-district health promotion hospitals directors at Ubonratchathanee province. Journal of health Science, 15(2) 2006: 323-329.
28. Rahman A. Ahmad, Mohd Nazir Mohd Adi, Haris Md. Noor, Abdul Ghafar Abdul Rahman & Tan Yushuang. The Influence of Leadership Style on Job Satisfaction among Nurses in Malaysia. Asian Social Science; Vol. 9, No. 9; 2013.
29. Fernandes, C. & Awamleh, R., The impact of transformational and transactional leadership styles on employee's satisfaction and performance: an empirical test in a multicultural environment. International Business and Economics Research, vol. 3, no.8, 2004: pp. 65-76.
30. Sultana A, Riaz R, Mehmood F, Khurshid R. Level of job satisfaction among nurses working in tertiary care hospitals of Rawalpindi. RMJ. 2011; 36(2): 150-154.
31. Daniel, C. and Wolf, G.A. Transformational Leadership in Nursing Science: a test of Theory. Journal of Nursing Administration. 22(1), 1992: 60-65.

32. Felton,S.L, Transactional and Transformational Leadership and Teacher Job Satisfaction. Dissertation Abstracts International. 67(7), 1995.
33. Mahmood G. and Soheylla Y. A Study of Relationship Between Transformational Leadership and Personnel Creativity in Higher Education Centers. World Applied Sciences Journal 17 (6), 2012: 684-693
34. Morsup N. Transformatic leadership character that have Effect to Organization climate among sub-district health promotion hospitals directors at Rachaburee province. A thesis for Master of Science (Public Health). Mahidol University, 2006.
35. Morrison, R.S., Jones, R. & Fuller, B. The Relation between Leadership Style and Empowerment on Job Satisfaction of Nurses in Iran. Journal of Nursing Administration, 27(2), 1997: 27-34.
36. Mulmai K. Correlation between transformatic leadership among school administrators and teaching efficiency in their teachers at Pratumthanee academic area1. .Master degree thesis. (Educational Technology and Communication), Rajamangala University of Technology Thanyaburi, 2011.